Focusing on interculturality: a literature review on language education projects and studies in border contexts.

Enfocando la interculturalidad: revisión de literatura sobre proyectos y estudios de educación en lenguas realizados en contextos de frontera

Carolina Lourenço-Simões*, Maria Helena Araújo e Sá* and María Matesanz del Barrio**.

*Centro de Investigação em Didática e Tecnologia na Formação de Formadores. University of Aveiro (Portugal)

**Laboratory of Applied Linguistics. Complutense University of Madrid (Spain)

Abstract

Borders are often characterized by the emergence of asymmetrical power relations that convey structures of domination-subordination, which potentially contribute to a negative experience of their superdiversity. It is important to deconstruct this reality through the development of plurilingual and intercultural knowledge, skills, and attitudes. Starting from the research question “what is the perspective of interculturality behind language education projects and studies developed in border contexts?”, we defined as objectives: (i) to identify and analyze language education projects and studies developed in border regions; and (ii) to discuss, based on the selected corpus, different epistemological and hermeneutical perspectives associated with the concept of interculturality. We conducted the research in ERIC, Redalyc, SciELO, Scopus and Web of Science databases, in the Community Research and Development Information Service and the European Commission scientific repositories, and in the website of Universidad Federal de Integración Latinoamericana. Consisting of 11 studies and projects, the selected corpus was subjected to categorical content analysis. The results show dissonances regarding the concept of

1 Correspondence: Carolina Lourenço-Simões, carolinalsimoes@ua.pt, Campus Universitário de Santiago 3810-193, 37008, Aveiro, Portugal, 37008,
interculturality in educational discourses, specifically at the level of implemented language education policies and programs. The maintenance of monolingual approaches in educational discourses and the scarcity of studies and programs developed in borders that allow to deal with these approaches highlight the urgency of projects that promote the resignification of these regions as spaces of bilateral symmetrical relations and multiple coexistences that value individuals’ hybrid identities.

**Keywords:** interculturality; border; plurilingualism; languages education.

**Resumen**

Las fronteras se caracterizan, a menudo, por la aparición de relaciones de poder asimétricas que transmiten estructuras de dominación-subordinación que pueden contribuir a una experiencia negativa de su superdiversidad. Es importante deconstruir esta realidad mediante el desarrollo de conocimientos, destrezas y actitudes plurilingües e interculturales. Partiendo de la pregunta de investigación “¿cuál es la perspectiva de interculturalidad en proyectos y estudios de educación en lenguas desarrollados en contextos de frontera?”, definimos como objetivos: (i) identificar y analizar proyectos y estudios de educación en lenguas desarrollados en fronteras; y (ii) discutir, a partir del corpus seleccionado, diferentes perspectivas epistemológicas y hermenéuticas asociadas al concepto de interculturalidad. Realizamos la investigación en las bases de datos ERIC, Redalyc, SciELO, Scopus y Web Of Science, en los repositorios científicos de la Community Research and Development Information Service y de la Comisión Europea, así como en la página web de la Universidad Federal de Integración Latinoamericana. El corpus seleccionado, compuesto por 11 estudios y proyectos, fue sometido a un análisis de contenido categorial. Los resultados muestran disonancias sobre el concepto de interculturalidad en los discursos educativos, concretamente a nivel de las políticas y programas educativos en lenguas implementados. La conservación de enfoques monolingües en esos discursos y la escasez de estudios y programas desarrollados en las fronteras que permitan hacer frente a dichos enfoques ponen de manifiesto la urgencia de proyectos que promuevan la resignificación de estas regiones como espacios de relaciones bilaterales simétricas y convivencias múltiples que valoren las identidades híbridas de los sujetos.

**Palabras clave:** interculturalidad; frontera; plurilingüismo; educación en lenguas.

**Introduction and objectives**

Borders bring together multiple, sometimes antagonistic meanings, and can be seen as spaces of encounter and sharing or loci of hostility and conflict. Considered contact zones and influenced by complex geopolitical and historical variables, they are often the scene of oppositions generated by asymmetrical power relations in which inequalities emerge between the administrative, organisational and social systems of neighbouring countries (Putsche, 2022), which can contribute to a negative perception and experience of the context of superdiversity that characterises these regions. To face the challenges of linguistic and cultural diversity and deconstruct such ideologies, the importance of preparing subjects to adopt an intercultural citizenship that allows them to relate to other cultures, mediating and understanding, in a constant exercise of otherness, the similarities
and differences that complete and complement them, is recognised. A reflexive dialogic approach is therefore required, in an exercise of "composite improvisation" (Dervin, 2021). It is through interaction and processes of (re)negotiation between cultures that alternative ideologies are co-constructed and explored, other ways of being, being and thinking (in) the world, from a subversive perspective vis-à-vis the dominant system imposed by various local and global ideological apparatuses (ibidem). Given that languages manifest themselves as vehicles of access to cultures and vice versa (Piccardo et al., 2022), language education emerges as privileged to promote the development of knowledge, skills and attitudes in this field.

Depending on the context in which it is applied, the concept of interculturality takes on different meanings, at times being used with dissonant socio-political intentions (Walsh, 2012). Consequently, it can adopt a perspective that is: (1) functional, in which the aim is to insert minority groups into the dominant social system in order to homogenise linguistic and cultural diversity and soften or avoid possible conflicts with the established order; (2) relational, in which national identity is affirmed as a product of ethno-cultural hybridity with the aim of camouflaging existing power relations; or (3) critical, in which national identity is affirmed as a product of ethno-cultural hybridity with the aim of camouflaging existing power relations; or (3) critical, outlining principles of action that challenge the established dominant order by valuing linguistic and cultural diversity, especially with the inclusion of historically marginalised ethnic and cultural groups (Walsh, 2012).

Therefore, our study seeks to answer the question "what is the perspective of interculturality in language education projects and studies developed in border contexts?", with the following objectives: (i) to identify and analyse language education projects and studies developed in border regions; and (ii) to discuss, based on the selected corpus, different epistemological and hermeneutic perspectives associated with the concept of interculturality.

**Method**

This study is part of the semi-systematic reviews, seeking to identify current studies that allow us to understand the "state of knowledge" of our research topic (Snyder, 2019): the perspective of interculturality present in language education studies and projects developed in border contexts.

Once the initial methodological principles had been established by defining the research question and objectives, we proceeded to data collection. To do this, we began by carrying out an initial search in the following databases: ERIC (collection and thesaurus), Redalyc, SciELO, Scopus and Web of Science. Before starting, we defined the keywords in English, Spanish and Portuguese. Next, we present, as an example, the words used in English:

(Plurilingual* OR multilingual*) AND (Intercultural* OR "cultural awareness" OR multicultrual* OR "cross-cultural" OR "intercultural dialogue" OR decolonisation) AND ("cross-border" OR "border region" OR border) AND education
In order to confer greater validity, rigour and transparency to the process (Cohen et al., 2018), we outline the selection criteria for the studies that make up the documentary corpus, focusing firstly on formal aspects, detailed in Table 1.

Table 1.

**Formal criteria for the selection of studies**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Form criteria</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Open access</td>
<td>The document is available in open access to the scientific community.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Period of publication</td>
<td>The document was published over the last 20 years (2001-2021).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer-review</td>
<td>The paper was peer-reviewed.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

We applied the keywords mentioned, as well as the formal order criteria referred to. The results obtained in each and every one of the databases used were those presented in Table 3. We highlight that the large number of studies in Redalyc, after the application of all the formal order criteria (N=1735), led to the addition of the filter "education", restricted specifically to that database, allowing us to reduce its results (N=873).

Subsequently, we defined the content criteria for corpus selection, set out in Table 2.

Table 2.

**Content criteria for selection of studies**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Content criteria</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Relationship between title and summary-our theme</td>
<td>The title and abstract of the paper focus on language education and assume border regions as the context for the application of the study.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In this sequence, we read the titles and performed a reconnaissance reading (Cardoso et al., 2010) of the abstracts of the 961 articles obtained in all the databases, and excluded 954 studies, as they were not related to our research topic. In fact, some articles took as their focus projects in other areas of specialisation, such as health; others focused on language education, but were not applied in border contexts; and still others approached only an ethic of cross-border cooperation. Consequently, the final corpus of databases is composed of 7 studies (3 from ERIC; 2 from Redalyc and 2 from Web of Science).

We note that the inconsistency between the key-words applied and these results has surprised us, highlighting limitations in the search process which we reflect on in the conclusions.
Table 3.

Number of documents obtained after the application of the selection criteria

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criteria</th>
<th>Databases</th>
<th>ERIC collection</th>
<th>ERIC thesaurus</th>
<th>SciELO</th>
<th>Scopus</th>
<th>Redalyc</th>
<th>Web of Science</th>
<th>Total number of studies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Open access</td>
<td></td>
<td>N= 98</td>
<td>N= 0</td>
<td>N= 0</td>
<td>N= 4</td>
<td>N= 1854</td>
<td>N= 9</td>
<td>N= 1965</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Period of publication</td>
<td></td>
<td>N= 84</td>
<td>N= 0</td>
<td>N= 0</td>
<td>N= 4</td>
<td>N= 1735</td>
<td>N= 9</td>
<td>N= 1832</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer-review</td>
<td></td>
<td>N= 75</td>
<td>N= 0</td>
<td>N= 0</td>
<td>N= 4</td>
<td>N= 1735</td>
<td>N= 9</td>
<td>N= 1823</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>N= 961</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relationship between title and summary</td>
<td></td>
<td>N=3</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>N=0</td>
<td>N=2</td>
<td>N=2</td>
<td>N=7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Given the small corpus, a second search was carried out, this time in the Community Research and Development Information Service (CORDIS) and European Commission repositories.

Considering that the set of keywords used to search the previously identified databases proved ineffective when applied to these repositories, culminating in 0 results, we used each of the previously identified key terms in isolation. We therefore searched word/expression by word/expression. Subsequently, we selected, from among the filters provided in the repositories, "field of science" and restricted the search to the descriptors "educational sciences", "inclusive education", "democracy" and "ethnology", in the case of CORDIS; and, concerning the European Commission website, we applied the filter "theme", in which we classified the search under the descriptors: "cross-border territory", "cross-border, transnational and inter-regional cooperation", "education", "education and training", "education and training, lifelong learning", "social inclusion" and "social inclusion, jobs, education and training". In addition to the filters applied, we also looked at the following criteria:
Table 4.

**Project selection criteria**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criteria</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Access to website</td>
<td>The project has an associated website with information available on its implementation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Period of publication</td>
<td>The project was implemented over the last 20 years (2001-2021).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

At the end of the process, we obtained 1 project in the CORDIS repository and 2 in the European Commission repository.

In order to obtain a broader *corpus*, we proceeded to a final search on the website of the "Universidad Federal de Integración Latinoamericana" (UNILA), UNILA is an institution that seeks regional development and Latin American integration, specifically in the constituent countries of MERCOSUR (Argentina, Brazil, Paraguay, Uruguay and Venezuela), based on the assumptions of cultural exchange and transnational cooperation. In this sense, we chose it as an institution with a relevant history related to cross-border cooperation.

The search on the UNILA website was carried out in the following order: "Institutes" - "Latin American Institute of Art, Culture and History" (ILAACH) - "Interdisciplinary Nucleus for Language and Intercultural Studies" (NIELI) - "Programmes, projects and courses". When selecting them, the same criteria were taken into account as those applied in the scientific repositories (see Table 4), which resulted in the identification of 2 projects, one of them already named in the results of the database search process ("Proyecto Escuelas Bilingües Interculturales de Frontera").

We point out that the data obtained from the sources are of a different nature, since in the repositories and on the UNILA website it is not information extracted from scientific articles, as in the databases, but information extracted from the official pages of the projects listed in these same sources.

In the light of the above, and considering the data collected, we highlight the recognition of 7 studies and 4 projects developed in the field of language education in border regions.

**Chosen corpus and its characterisation**

We identified the studies, their bibliographical references, the projects, their associated web pages, and the corresponding search sources (Table 5). To speed up analysis, we assigned a code to each study and project, the first consisting of the letter "E" associated with a random cardinal number, and the second of the consonant "P", also associated with a random number.
Table 5.

Coding and identification of studies and projects

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Codes</th>
<th>Studies (S) and projects (P)</th>
<th>Search sources</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>P1</td>
<td>&quot;Bildungskooperationen in den Grenzregionen&quot;. (<a href="https://www.big-projects.eu/start/">https://www.big-projects.eu/start/</a>)</td>
<td>CORDIS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P2</td>
<td>&quot;Diversity4kids</td>
<td>European Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P3</td>
<td>&quot;Linguacluster</td>
<td>European Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P4</td>
<td>&quot;Formação docente: pedagogia de fronteira&quot;.</td>
<td>UNILA</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
It should be noted that the P2 and P4 websites, which were available at the time of the corpus analysis, were no longer active at the time of submission of this article.

After identifying the selected corpus (Appendix 1), we proceeded to characterise it, taking into account the following dimensions: (a) year of publication of the study/period of execution of the project; and (b) geographical context where the research was carried out.

Two graphs are presented below: Figure 1, which shows the year of publication of the studies in the corpus, and Figure 2, which shows the period of implementation of the projects. It can be seen that all the studies in the selected corpus (six) correspond to recent publications, carried out in the last five years, and only one dates back to the early 2000s. In terms of the time span of the projects in the corpus, most of them (three) focus on the second decade of the 2000s. Their duration is variable, ranging from two to six years.
With regard to the geographical context of implementation of the projects and studies analysed, seven refer to the Americas, specifically to Central and South American countries, with a greater incidence in the United States of America (USA)-Mexico border region (four). Four refer to projects and studies carried out in European border regions, more specifically in Central and Southern European countries, with Austria standing out as the country with the most studies/projects developed in this field (three). Comparing the number of studies and projects by continent, the prevalence of studies and projects on American borders is evident.

![Figure 3. Geographical context of implementation of selected studies and projects (by continent and border areas)](image)

**Results and discussion**

We conducted a categorical content analysis of the data collected, determining three categories (the first two defined *a priori*, the third *a posteriori*): (1) conceptions of interculturality in educational discourses in border contexts; (2) practices, methods and strategies used in language teaching in border contexts; and (3) contributions of language education to the (trans)formation of border subjects. The first category was divided into subcategories, finding theoretical support in the taxonomy of interculturality (IC) proposed by Walsh (2012), based on three typologies: (1.1) functional, (1.2) relational and (1.3) critical.
Conceptions of interculturality in educational discourses in border contexts

With regard to the conceptions of CI in border contexts, it stands out that all the projects and discourses of the authors of the studies analysed adopt a critical CI perspective. However, there is a variation in the conception of CI in the educational discourses described therein, specifically at the level of language education policies and programmes implemented in the border regions in focus.

The studies refer to the prevalence of a functional conception of CI in language education policies, recurrently conceived as top-down and soft power policies based on monolingualism, on the defence of linguistic nationalism and on the border as a separating mark of a nation-state (E1; E3; E4; E5; E6; E7). These policies are applied, above all, in the geographical context of the US-Mexico (E1; E3; E4; E5) and Brazil-Argentina/Paraguay/Uruguay/Venezuela (E6; E7; P4) borders.

The US-Mexico border has historically preserved asymmetrical power relations and tensions between the two countries. This is evidenced in the US border territory by the subsistence of assimilationist ideologies and linguistic and cultural segregation (E1; E3; E4; E5), demonstrated in the: (i) unequal opportunities in educational institutions for Mexican Americans (E1; E3; E4; E5); (ii) creation of "Mexican schools" (E3); and (iii) proliferation of social movements calling for the exclusive use of English and the elimination of bilingual programmes from educational systems (e.g. "The English Only Movement"). The English Only Movement and/or the reduction or prohibition of the use of Spanish in the school community (e.g. "No Spanish Rule") (E1; E3; E4). As an extension of these language policy movements, legislative frameworks have been created and are still in force in many US states (e.g. "Proposition 203" in the State of Arizona) (E4), in which the immersive exposure of immigrant students to English language instruction in public schools for a transitional period is declared mandatory in order to achieve fluency in the target language and, consequently, to enable their participatory "inclusion" in socio-political spheres. Given the absence of an official language in the US, these measures arise strategically to empower English and delay the relevance and impact of Spanish, the language of the largest cultural minority in the region (E4; E5; Flowers, 2020). The hegemony of English as the lingua franca is thus perpetuated, adopting a discourse of the mother tongue as a problem. Unlike the border areas of the USA, those of Mexico are characterised by the adoption of official languages, specifically Hispanic. English takes on a strong expression, both from a perspective of the insertion of the Mexican community in the US, and from an instrumental perspective, with the recognition of the contributions of learning it for more job opportunities (E1; E4).

As for Brazil’s border with Argentina-Paraguay-Uruguay-Venezuela, one would expect it to represent a privileged locus for the implementation of systematic language policies based on Portuguese-Spanish bilingualism, given the high degree of intercomprehension provided by the familiarity of the languages involved (Brito de Arruda and Pereira Tamwing, 2023; Calvo del Olmo and Erazo, 2019; Matesanz del Barrio, 2019; Oliveira and Morello, 2019) and the intense cross-border commercial activity (E6; E7). However, a linguistic nationalism is maintained that leads to discriminatory
ideologies, such as the forced extinction of minority languages and their variants (indigenous languages, sign languages, among others) (E6; E7). Although linguistic education policies promoting bilingual education have been developed in the context of the Southern Common Market (MERCOSUR) in the 2000s, their unilateralism is highlighted by the non-introduction or scarcity of Spanish language teaching in the Brazilian context (E7). The monolingual ideology, dominant in this border region, is thus preserved.

Language policies that adopt functional CI are often reflected in the implementation of subtractive programmes (Herrera-Rocha and de la Piedra, 2018), such as transitional bilingual programmes (E1; E4). Contrary to what they advocate (the inclusion of students from other ethnicities and cultures), these programmes contribute to the stigmatisation of minorities, recognising linguistic and cultural diversity only as a way to ensure the preservation of the established order of the dominant social system (Walsh, 2012).

Despite the above, E3, E5, E7 and P4 identify the existence of additive programmes, such as dual language (E5) and bi/plurilingual education (E7; P4), which attempt to contradict the predominant functional CI language education policies in their geographical contexts through a critical CI perspective that promotes the valuing of the subjects’ languages and cultures. In these programmes, not only is their communicative repertoire emphasised, with equal consideration of their mother tongue and the target language, but they also aim to foster critical cultural awareness and the development of the ability to relate to, discover and interact with others. They therefore manifest themselves as forms of transgressive (re)action, in which resistance is offered to neoliberal capitalism and imposed colonial power patterns in favour of the reordering of the social system.

As mentioned above, although the predominance of language education policies described in the obtained corpus is functional CI, there are also critical CI perspectives, namely in the geographical context of the Austria-Slovakia/Hungary/Czech Republic, Austria-Italy, Germany-Belgium-Netherlands and Austria-Slovenia-Italy borders (E2; P1; P2; P3). Indeed, multilingualism and CI have become central to educational discourses in Europe. This is reflected in the joint effort to create educational agendas and guidance documents in this field, most notably the updated version of the 'Common European Framework of Reference for Languages (Companion Volume)' (Council of Europe, 2020), which gives greater prominence to the concepts of plurilingualism, CI and intercultural mediation. If, on the one hand, these policies do not always present linearity and continuity in practice (Castellotti, 2010; Walsh, 2012), on the other hand, they may frame additive programmes that reflect the ideologies conveyed in them, of which E2, P1, P2 and P3 are examples.

**Practices, methods and strategies used in language teaching in cross-border contexts**

The practices, methods and strategies used in language teaching in border contexts differ according to the programmes applied.
With regard to subtractive programmes (functional CI), more specifically transitional bilingual programmes (E1; E4), the adoption of one language only practices, in which pupils in the school community are encouraged to abandon their mother tongue, replacing it with the target language, is highlighted (E1; E4). In this sense, the use of the mother tongue is reduced to a minimal intervention, only to support the understanding of a concept in the dominant language, or even prohibited (E1; E4). These programmes aim at a mastery of the target language in its multiple linguistic competences (E1; E4), in a perspective rooted in a traditional paradigm of language education based on the myth of the ideal native speaker. Consequently, practices such as code-switching and translanguaging are marginalised and interpreted as obstacles to language learning (E1; E4; E6) or as ungrammaticalities to be corrected (E6). Also with regard to subtractive programmes, it is worth mentioning that assessment is a key summative instrument for measuring the degree of competence in target language learning, with the use of a final standardised test which determines the learner's exit from the transition programme on the basis of the result obtained (E1).

With regard to the additive programmes (critical CI), specifically the dual language programmes (E5), the centrality attributed to the concept of social justice is evident, which is associated with characteristics such as: (1) collaborative work with different educational actors, in particular in the design of policy guidelines in a perspective of shared governance; (2) the restructuring of the curriculum, with a less Eurocentric approach and more adapted to the contextual reality; and (3) the continuous training of teachers in bilingual education.

As regards bi/plurilingual education programmes (E2; E7; P1; P2; P3; P4), it should be noted that they often emerge as instruments of transnational cooperation (E2; E7; P1; P2; P3), with some shared characteristics being highlighted, in particular: (1) the qualification of teachers, through which contact with the epistemological, conceptual and pedagogical-didactic frameworks associated with bi/plurilingual and intercultural education at the borders, as well as reflection on their praxis, is provided in the context of in-service training (E2; E7; P1; P2; P3); (2) networking between teachers and other educational actors in a micro and macro dimension (political representatives, students, families, operational assistants, local entities) (E2; E7; P1; P2; P3); (3) the collaborative development of activities and the consequent production of innovative pedagogical-didactic materials (E2; E7; P1; P2; P3); (4) the articulation between curricula, in a more integrated and interdisciplinary perspective of language teaching (E2; E7; P1; P2; P3); and (5) the cross-border mobility of teachers (E2; E7) or students (P1; P3). Although P4 is not a transnational cooperation instrument, it should be noted that its central focus is on teacher training.

In additive programmes, the use of learners' plurilingual communicative repertoire is promoted (E2; E7; P1; P2; P3; P4), with prior knowledge of the languages forming part of that repertoire being understood as elements which speed up the learning of the target language. In this sense, translanguages are allowed, emerging, in E3, as cultural pedagogy, in which their use is combined with socio-dramatic activities (e.g. improvisational theatre, role-playing). Similarly, the production of interlanguage (e.g. Portuguese) (E6; E7) and the use of local language varieties (e.g. Texmex) (E3) are also accepted and introduced into teaching. In addition to the above, other practices, methods
and strategies for the promotion of CI in this domain are identified, namely: the use of Content and Language Integrated Learning (CLIL) methodology (E2); the use of multiliteracies to support learning (E3); the performance of drama (E3; P1; P2); creative writing (P2); and the construction of linguistic biographies (P3).

**Contributions of language education to the (trans)formation of frontier subjects**

According to McKinney (2017), language education policies and programmes exert a strong influence on the formation of subjects' identities. In this sense, it is worth mentioning that their beliefs find resonances in these discourses, highlighting, in a functional CI perspective, that: (i) students subjected to subtractive programmes have more positive images of the target language than of their mother tongue (E1); and (ii) teachers and relatives of dual nationality students consider that proficiency in English is synonymous with greater academic success (E1; E4; E5). These discourses, based on deficit theories, which argue that linguistic minorities are necessarily deficient and predisposed to academic failure, generate low teacher expectations of transitional bilingual pupils (E1), which have repercussions on their own expectations and academic performance. It is because of this Pygmalion effect that emergent bilingual learners often end up as school failures and even drop-outs (E5), not because of integration into a linguistic minority, contrary to the claims of the proponents of this theory (Halliday, 2017). Intrinsically, these discourses contribute to a negative perception on the part of teachers and the subjects themselves (students and families) towards the use of translanguages and code-switching, considering themselves "incapable" or "ignorant" for not having mastered the target language (E1; E4). Such insecurities are reflected in feelings of cultural shame (E1; Quiroz, 2001) and difficulty in creating bonds of belonging with the dominant social community (E1; E4), which often leads them to hide their identities of origin in an attempt at acceptance and inclusion (E1). Paradoxically, these same learners are observed to communicate in their mother tongue in non-formal and informal educational contexts as a sign of resistance and affirmation within their community of origin (E1). This ambivalent behaviour is, in fact, a reflection of their dilemmatic condition, so expressive in the words of Anzaldúa (2012, p. 77): "Because (...) I am (...) soul between two worlds, three, four, my head is buzzing with contradictions. I am north by all the voices that speak to me simultaneously". When extreme, this condition can result in the fragmentation of the self (Minuzzo and Ribeiro, 2017). To avoid this internal conflict, it is essential to value the pluralities of their identities, from an equal perspective (e.g. I am Mexican-American), and not wrapped in a disjunctive and excluding feeling (e.g. I am either Mexican or I am American).

The adoption of the critical CI paradigm enables this revaluation and contributes to its positive experience, enabling the construction of a third space (E6; Bhabha, 1994). Through the recognition of cultural capital (E3; E4) and the expansion of their communicative repertoire (E1; E2; E3; E6), the subjects will construct new meanings in relation to the surrounding reality, thus broadening their vision of the world (E2; E3; E6). From this perspective, languages are not understood from a merely structural/functional point of view, but rather as social semiotic systems carrying cultural norms (Halliday, 2017). They
emerge as complex, permeable and fluid constructions through which each subject draws his or her personal cartography (Piccardo et al., 2022; Krams, 2009). Contact with other languages and cultures thus contributes to self-knowledge (E4) and also to the acceptance and understanding of human diversity, based on values such as mutual respect (E2; P1; P2; P3; P4). It is also from this perspective that critical CI serves as a driving force for the emancipation of social groups that have been silenced throughout history (E5; E6; E7), promoting their participation in public spheres (E5). Not only from a social and relational point of view are the contributions of this approach to the (trans)formation of individuals evident. Following the cognitivist stream of Bialystok (2019) and Bialystok and Craik (2022), E1, E2, E3, E5 and E7 noted their influence on the development of creative thinking (E3), problem-solving ability (E3), executive functioning (E1) and enhanced neural responsiveness (E1). The transformations that occur in the bilingual brain improve students’ academic performance (E1; E2; E4; E5), which will eventually lead to more job opportunities (E2; E4).

Conclusions

We conclude that there are dissonances about the concept of CI in the described educational discourses, namely at the level of language education policies and implemented studies and programmes. Under the influence of top-down language education policies and soft power rooted in monolingual ideologies, the functional CI paradigm emerges as applied, in the corpus analysed, in American border contexts. These share characteristics such as asymmetry in power relations and unilateralism in action, with one neoliberal nationalist country standing out, with a more commodified view of society, exercising dominance over another. These policies are often reflected in the development of subtractive programmes, in particular transitional bilingual programmes (Herrera-Rocha and de la Piedra, 2018), in the case of the US-Mexico border context. These are based on one language only practices (ibidem; Cortez and Jáuregui, 2004), in which the hegemony of the dominant language and culture is produced in favour of a continuous attempt to exclude the learners’ mother tongue and culture. Thus, language systems, whether of non-parental languages (as in the case of English, Spanish and the varieties found on the border between the USA and Mexico) or of the same family (as in the case of Portuguese, Spanish and the varieties found on the border between Brazil and Spanish-speaking countries), are not seen as "zones of effraction" and contact (Coste, 2011), but rather as isolated and compartmentalised units of the subjects’ communicative repertoire. In this sense, and although these programmes recognise linguistic and cultural diversity and claim as their aim the inclusion of students from other ethnic groups and cultures in the socio-educational community and in political spheres, they propose, less or more informally, the intention of linguistic and cultural cleansing of these subjects through mechanisms of linguistic and cultural imposition by the elites, thus producing an exclusionary inclusion. Consequently, discriminatory beliefs, perceptions and attitudes are transmitted that have implications for their identities: either at the individual level, which can result in cultural feelings of shame (Quiroz, 2001) or internal dilemmatic conflicts (Anzaldúa, 2012); or at the group level, making it difficult to create bonds of belonging to the dominant social
group (Herrera-Rocha and de la Piedra, 2018). In fact, the idea of the border as a state-limit (Hamman, 2019) and territorial configuration framed in a fixed perspective of national identity (Kolosov, 2020) is fossilised in the discourses and practices of the subjects, hindering the experience of the border as a hybrid space of miscegenation.

Although discourses on language education policies often show continuity in the programmes implemented, the development of additive critical CI programmes in predominantly functional socio-political contexts stands out. At this juncture, critical CI is adopted from a perspective of decoloniality, i.e. as transgression and resistance to imposed colonial power norms, giving voice and empowering ethnic and cultural minorities in a subversive way vis-à-vis the instituted social order. These programmes materialise, for example, in dual language and bi/plurilingual education approaches, fostering the self-regulation of the subjects’ plurilingual repertoire (Oliveira and Morello, 2019; Semec, 2018) and enhancing the development of knowledge, skills and attitudes conducive to the appreciation “of the diverse diversities of the self and the other” (Dervin, 2010, p. 157).

In contexts where critical CI language education policies prevail, additive programmes with the same approach emerge. Programmes based on this policy framework, which mostly manifest themselves as instruments of transnational cooperation, emphasise, above all, a concern for teacher qualification. This qualification is provided through in-service training courses that allow contact with the epistemological, conceptual and pedagogical-didactic frameworks associated with bi/plurilingual and intercultural education at borders, and which have an impact on the construction and mobilisation of innovative educational methods and strategies. The articulation between national curricula, collaborative work and the exchange of teachers and students are also central axes of some of these projects, which not only objectify critical CI in the socio-educational context, reiterating a border experience as a locus of union and linguistic continuum, but also as experiences carried out in the professional teaching context.

In synthesis, the preservation of monolingual ideologies in educational discourses associated with the scarcity of bi/plurilingual education and critical CI programmes on borders, reflected in the reduced corpus obtained, demonstrates the urgency of implementing projects aimed at re-signifying these regions as spaces of bilateral symmetrical relations and multiple coexistences, contributing to the valuation of the pluralities of the self and the other.

We note, once again, that despite the multiplicity of search sources used, the corpus obtained is scarce due to the methodological process adopted. According to Harari et al. (2020), there are two main factors for this type of search to be successful or not: the choice of key words and the choice of databases. Considering the relevance of the databases chosen, which are widely recognised in the scientific field, we would point out that the key words, although relevant, may err on the side of excess, as may the use of Boolean operators. In this sense, the corpus obtained must be considered in the light of this same methodological process. Although small in number, we recognise that the results are of great relevance to the field of study in question, allowing access to new insights at the level of knowledge and offering clues for future research.
Funding

Work financed by Fundos Nacionales Portugueses through FCT - Fundação para a Ciência e a Tecnologia -, I.P. within the scope of the research grant with reference 2022.09929.BD [01/09/2022 to 31/08/2025], of the research grant with reference BI/UI57/10011/2022 [01/06/2022 to 31/08/2022] and by Verbas of the Departamento de Educação e Psicologia da Universidade de Aveiro, from the Convenio Específico de Colaboración entre the institution and the Organización de Estados Iberoamericanos para la Educación, Ciencia y la Cultura, within the scope of the research grant with reference BI/UI28/10011/2022 [16/01/2022 to 16/05/2022].

References


Putsche, J. (2022). L’interculturel contextualisé: franco-allemand, frontalier, transculturel - Une approche sociodidactique. [Dossier submitted for the habilitation to the direction of researchers, Université de Lorraine]. https://hal.science/tel-03882905/document


Date of receipt: 12 April 2023.
Review date: 19 July 2023.
Date of acceptance: 22 November 2023.
## Appendix 1 - Characterisation of the studies and projects constituting the analysis corpus

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Studies (E) and projects (P)</th>
<th>Year(s) of Publication/implementation</th>
<th>Geographic border context</th>
<th>Participants (focused)</th>
<th>Purpose</th>
<th>Methodology</th>
<th>Results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| E1   | "Ideologies of language among ELLs on the US-Mexico border: the case of a transitional bilingual programme". | 2018 | American continent: United States of America-Mexico border. | Pupils in the 4th year of school who are part of a Transition Bilingual Programme. | To analyse the linguistic ideologies of students in grades 1-8 who are part of a Transitional Bilingual Programme implemented in a border school in El Paso. | The study, which was qualitative and grounded in grounded theory, was conducted in a Transitional Bilingual Program classroom at a school in El Paso. Based on the research questions "What are the language beliefs of students in a Transitional Bilingual Program?" and "How are the ideologies of these students constructed in this context?", the researchers conducted participant observation of the classes, accompanied by field notes, and conducted semi-structured interviews with the participating students. The data collected were subjected to an emergent content analysis, taking into account recurrent themes, and four categories emerged: (1) forgetting Spanish; (2) Spanish for transition; (3) use In the Bilingual Transition Programme in question, English was the only language of instruction most of the time and the use of Spanish, the pupils' mother tongue, was discouraged. Therefore, they perceived that bilingual transition not only did not imply the reinforcement of their bilingual identity, but was synonymous with forgetting their mother tongue. This demonstrates the pupils' internalisation of the monolingual educational policies that are lived in the school environment and reflected in teaching practices. Despite the appropriation of this ideology in formal contexts, it was observed that pupils used their multilingual
of Spanish when the teacher is not present; and (4) dichotomy between non-formal and formal discourses.

To discuss the knowledge and experiences of teachers participating in the mobility programme "Comenius Regio partnership of Slovenia and Italy" in terms of their personal and professional development.

The study focused on the mobility programme "Comenius Regio partnership of Slovenia and Italy" (2010-2013), which aimed at the personal and professional development of teachers in a context of in-service training, as well as the development of pupils' plurilingual and intercultural competences through the development of common learning projects adopting CLIL methodology. Data were collected through interviews with participating teachers at the beginning and at the end of the project implementation. Content analysis was conducted according to the personal, professional and social dimensions of the 'teacher-led change' model, namely: (1) changes in teaching practices; (2) changes in learning outcomes and student achievement; and repertoire to communicate in non-formal contexts.

Participating teachers acknowledged the contribution of cross-border mobility programmes to the development of their plurilingual and intercultural competences, as well as to their overall professional development, which is reflected in new pedagogical and pedagogical practices.

"Mobile Teachers at Border Schools - Multilingualism and Interculturalism as New Challenges for Professional Development".

Teachers undergoing cross-border mobility.

2018 European continent: Austria-Slovenia-Italy border.
To analyse, in the context of the bilingual classroom of a kindergarten located on the Texas-Mexico border, how the translinguistic practices of emergent bilingual students contribute to their own conception of socio-dramatic educational spaces.

The research integrates a broader qualitative case study, taking as the research question "What is the purpose of preschool students' translinguistic practices during socio-dramatic activities in a Head Start classroom?". Data collection involved observing and recording the moments when the children experienced the socio-dramatic activities, and following up the record in field notes; workshops were offered to teachers with the aim of enhancing the development of the socio-dramatic activities, with themes emerging from the pupils' cultural contexts, to improve their literacy skills and engage them more in the learning process; face-to-face interviews were conducted with teachers. The analysis of the data followed a critical Latin race theory (LatCrit) and translanguages, grouping the episodes by the categories: translanguages for imagining, Teachers valued the plural identities of emergent bilingual learners by promoting translinguistic practices to enrich the curriculum and the socio-dramatic activities developed in the classroom. In turn, the learners involved applied language competences in these contexts to create, imagine and regulate their learning, with the use of translinguistic mechanisms acting as an enabler during the process.

RIE, 2024, 42(2)
"Influence of the social context on bilingual education in a border area of Sonora and Arizona".

2004 American continent: border between the United States and Mexico. Two families, one Mexican and one Mexican-American, live on the US-Mexico border. To analyse the perceptions of these two families about their border identity, the use of English and Spanish and the educational options in the context in which they live. The research is based on two case studies. To achieve its purpose, interviews were conducted with the parents of each family. The interview scripts took into account an anthropological perspective of the "Funds of Knowledge" study, applied in the domestic context of minority groups in the United States in order to identify the resources of the families, specifically at the cultural and intellectual level. A content analysis was conducted and the following categories were inductively created from the data collected: (1) language use and its context of application; (2) impact and influence on education; and (3) border identity.

Mexican family members perceived their children's learning of English as an advantage in the context in which they lived, without perceiving it as a threat to the loss of their cultural identity or their mother tongue. The use of Spanish, a stigmatised minority language in this American region, reinforced family networks and ties of belonging to their culture of origin. In contrast, Mexican American family members felt more vulnerable, as they felt that not communicating in English excluded them from political spheres, with more limited access to certain opportunities.

"Righting past wrongs: A superintendent’s" 2017 American continent: A superintendent To analyse the beliefs and The case study, qualitative in nature, seeks to answer the superintendent-participant recognised the
social justice leadership for dual language education along the U.S. Mexico border. The actions of an El Paso Independent School District superintendent in addressing the social injustices that afflict Mexican and Mexican American emergent bilingual students through the implementation of bilingual education reform.

Questions: (1) What is the role of the superintendent-participant in supporting dual language; (2) What actions and orientations were necessary to implement dual language; and (3) What are the superintendent’s beliefs and ideologies that support his action? For this purpose, school board meetings and professional development sessions were observed and recorded in field notes, which were supplemented with information extracted from relevant documents (meeting orders and school reports). Semi-structured interviews were also conducted with the superintendent and other stakeholders. Data were analysed using NVivo 10 software in two phases: 1. codes derived from theoretical frameworks adopted within social justice leadership and dual language; 2. categories related to social justice leadership: advocacy, vision, challenging the status quo, leadership orientation and beliefs, politics/power/influence, and social/personal interactions.

Attention was also paid to how impossibility of achieving his personal belief in social justice without the establishment of partnerships with the local community and the buy-in of various political bodies and educational actors. He demonstrated that he had mastered a range of competencies and had a concise cultural and linguistic background that provided the basis for him to act to raise awareness and sensitisation for the implementation of dual language education reform. This highlights that values, beliefs and ideologies can positively influence leadership capacity.
these categories were linked to the superintendent’s personal beliefs and the district context.

To discuss translinguistic practices, negatively perceived as ungrammaticalities in texts produced in a school context, aiming at a change of paradigm in order to sensitise teachers in the triple border region Argentina-Brazil-Paraguay on linguistic and cultural diversity.

The research is part of a broader study, assuming as a theoretical and methodological approach the articulation between the area of Applied Linguistics and Ethnography as a way of reflecting on the experience of the subjects who inhabit the social context in focus in interaction with other border regions. To achieve the proposed purpose, we analysed the translinguistic practices of a text written by a cross-border student in the school context of the triple border between Argentina-Brazil-Paraguay and a fragment written by one of the authors of the subversive aesthetic-literary movement “Portunhol Selvagem”.

Translinguistic practices are perceived positively when they appear as literary resources and negatively when the focus is on texts written by pupils in school contexts. Thus, monolingual ideologies are perpetuated in educational discourses and, more specifically, in initial and in-service teacher training, even in border regions, where linguistic and cultural diversity is a constant even more present in the daily lives of individuals. In this sense, we suggest the possibility of emancipatory and reflexive teacher training that will help to overthrow the monolingual myth and contribute to the construction of more inclusive societies.

To discuss possibilities for the development of linguistic The study offers a reflection and analysis of the “Bilingual and Intercultural Border Schools Project”, focusing mainly on the

The project analysed undertook the purpose of strengthening regional ties, the quality of the education system
that form MERCOSUR (Argentina, Brazil, Paraguay, Uruguay and Venezuela). followed and succeeded (a) the "Bilingual and Intercultural Border Schools Project".

educational policies that promote Portuguese-Spanish bilingualism and its interrelations with paradigms for its valorisation, based on the analysis of the political and socio-historical conditions that contextualised the implementation of the "Bilingual and Intercultural Border Schools Project".

socio-historical coordinates and the political currents that accompanied its entire design process: genesis, implementation and completion.

in the area and promoting bilingualism and interculturalism, integrating Portuguese and Spanish languages into school curricula through the exchange of teachers between mirror schools in the border regions and the construction of common learning projects. Considering the (centralised) power structures, the prevailing monolingual policies in the region and the education system, based on conventional monolingual practices and the national curriculum, the sustainability of the project was low. This is also representative of the institutional volatility of language policies in the region, strongly conditioned by geopolitical variables.

To promote multilingualism and cultural awareness towards the neighbouring country, as well as social cohesion

This is a macro-project comprising three projects that share the same strategic objectives and are developed in different border regions, but always with the Austrian border as their epicentre.

The qualification of teachers, in a context of continuous training, in the construction and mobilisation of innovative teaching methods promoting multilingualism and cultural awareness was one of the results of the project. The

P1 "Bildungskooperation in den Grenzregionen" 2016-2020

The European continent: Austria-Slovakia; Austria-Hungary; and Various educational actors (pupils, teachers, principals, operational assistants, parents). To promote multilingualism and cultural awareness in the area and promoting bilingualism and interculturalism, integrating Portuguese and Spanish languages into school curricula through the exchange of teachers between mirror schools in the border regions and the construction of common learning projects. Considering the (centralised) power structures, the prevailing monolingual policies in the region and the education system, based on conventional monolingual practices and the national curriculum, the sustainability of the project was low. This is also representative of the institutional volatility of language policies in the region, strongly conditioned by geopolitical variables.

To promote multilingualism and cultural awareness towards the neighbouring country, as well as social cohesion

This is a macro-project comprising three projects that share the same strategic objectives and are developed in different border regions, but always with the Austrian border as their epicentre.

The qualification of teachers, in a context of continuous training, in the construction and mobilisation of innovative teaching methods promoting multilingualism and cultural awareness was one of the results of the project. The
Austria–Czech Republic border. and economic development in the target area through the implementation of a language learning programme in primary schools and kindergartens in the border regions of the Central European area.

In the first phase, in-service training was provided to teacher-participants focusing on methods to promote multilingualism and cultural awareness, as well as the development of emotional skills through theatre pedagogy. Collaborative networks between the different educational actors were strengthened, in particular through workshops, seminars, conferences and individual tutorials. Field visits were also carried out in which teachers and initial teacher training students travelled to schools in the neighbouring country, allowing direct contact with the teaching methods of their colleagues. In a second phase, the application of pedagogical methods developed in in-service training was expanded in schools through the establishment of a cross-border mobility initiative which included cultural exchanges and regular joint events. Collaborative networks were strengthened in particular through the creation of a repository of guidelines, resources and pedagogical materials, enabling further work on a sustainable research perspective. Ultimately, the project has also increased the employability rate in the regions involved with a view to designing a common labour market.
| P2 | "Diversity4kids" 2012-2014 | The European continent (Euroregion Tyrol-South Tyrol and Tyrol-Trentino): Austria-Italy border. | Students and teachers from 1st to 3rd cycle of basic education, and facilitators. | To develop, in an intercultural perspective, and through playful narrative activities, the competences of pupils, specifically on an emotional, cognitive and social level, overcoming prejudices and discriminatory attitudes and preparing them to live in a complex and pluralistic society. Following the identification of the educational needs of the Primary 1 to 3 classes, several narrative and interactive play activities were designed and implemented, namely: biographical workshops, creative writing, role-playing and improvisation theatre. These workshops, each lasting two hours, were evaluated by the pupils through interviews conducted by the teacher-participants and facilitators/mediators. |
| P3 | "Linguaclector" 2007-2013 | European continent (Meuse-Rhine Euroregion): Germany-Belgium-Netherlands | Various educational actors (pupils and teachers, principals, operational assistants, parents). | Various initiatives promoting the development of linguistic and cultural competences in German, French and Dutch, as well as intercultural understanding, such as (virtual and real) one- to three-day cultural exchanges for student-participants through partnerships with schools in other countries; German, French Linguistic and cultural competences in German, French and Dutch were developed, as well as the intercultural understanding of the pupils. The production of various pedagogical and didactic resources and materials in the course of the project, applied in this context, made possible the publication |
initiatives that broaden knowledge of neighbouring languages and, inherently, of the cultures associated with them.

and Dutch language courses; career guidance and coaching; and work placements for students aged 16-19, where they had contact with professional organisations.

of a book bringing together all this documentation.

American continent: border town in Brazil (Foz do Iguaçu).

To train, in a context of ongoing training, teachers to work with the linguistic and cultural diversity that characterises the reality of the classroom in the municipal schools of Foz do Iguaçu, seeking to bring intercultural border education to the debate.

In each year of project implementation, continuous training initiatives were promoted. In 2016, reflections on the concepts of border, interculturality and languages were promoted, questioning the feeling of living on the border. In 2017, and considering the balance of the discussions promoted in the previous year, scientific meetings were held in schools with high demographics of immigrant students in which discussions were generated on the school as a border institution and, more specifically, on the place of immigrant students in municipal education policies. In 2018, teacher training programmes were created on the teaching of Spanish and English in primary school. In 2019, the

The results obtained include teacher training in the field of plurilingual and intercultural border education, which has had an impact on the production of pedagogical-didactic materials for the primary teaching of Spanish and English, as well as on the consequent development of pupils' competences in Spanish and English.
teaching of Spanish and English as additional languages was promoted in two municipal primary schools.